

SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

Wednesday, March 1, 2000
10:00 a.m. - 3:00 p.m.
Honolulu International Airport
Interisland Terminal Conference Rooms, 7th Floor

Meeting Minutes

Attendance

SAC Members Present: Sallie Beavers, Hannah Bernard, James Coon, Margaret Dupree, Bill Friedl, Walter Haas, June Harrigan Lum, Lou Herman, Greg Kaufman, Kevin Kelly (for Bob Schroeder), Bill Lennan, Craig MacDonald, Charles Maxwell, Patty Miller, Paul Nachtigall, Dick Poirier, Glenn Soma, Mike Stanton, Claud Sutcliffe, Jeff Walters.

SAC Alternates Present: Carl Berg, Harold Meheula, Jim Walsh.

Excused: Ron Bass, Colette Machado, James Keli'ipio Mawae, Bob Schroeder, Mike Tosatto.

Absent: Terry White.

Others Present:

NOAA: Kellie Araki, Naomi McIntosh, Allen Tom.

Public: Lani Neill (PICHTR), Gerard Nihous (PICHTR), Rob Wilder (PWF).

Distributed Materials

- Meeting Agenda
- Draft Scientific Research Plan for the HIIWNMS
- Proposed Resolution Sanctuary Manager's Proposed Sabbatical
- Conservation Committee correspondence
- Memorandum from Jeff Walters

Welcoming Remarks

SAC Chair Jim Coon called the meeting to order at 10:15 a.m. Mr. Coon introduced SAC members Kevin Kelly, the WESPAC representative in Bob Schroeder's absence and Jim Walsh, the ocean recreation alternate for Ron Bass. Members of the public included Liza Simon, the state's new public relations person for the Sanctuary and Rob Wilder, education director for the Pacific Whale Foundation.

Charlie Maxwell announced that he will be leaving the meeting at 12:00 noon and made a motion requesting that new business be moved up on the agenda before

committee reports. Mr. Maxwell also asked that time limits on agenda items be suspended for this discussion. Motion carried.

Minutes from the meeting held on November 17, 1999 were approved on the condition that they be changed to reflect Bill Friedl's attendance.

New Business

SAC Officer Elections:

Dick Poirier called for a motion to defer SAC officer elections until Allen Tom's return from his one-year detail in September 2001. Questions were raised regarding whether this would mean that all SAC terms would then be carried over as well as the officers and whether the SAC was legally allowed to extend their own terms. Mr. Tom acknowledged that this was possible but it would have to be requested from NOAA. Greg Kaufman indicated that there is no guarantee that all SAC members are interested in retaining their current seats, much less holding them for another year. Mr. Poirier proposed an amended motion to request that NOAA extend the current non-government seats until Mr. Tom returns from his detail (keeping in mind the staggering of seats for continuity). Motion failed. *(Note: The following non-government seats have 2-year terms which expire in July 2000: Business/Commerce, Citizen-At-Large, Commercial Shipping, Conservation, Fishing, Native Hawaiian, Ocean Recreation, Tourism and Whale Watching. The following seats have 3-year terms, which expire in July 2001: Hawaii County, Honolulu County, Kauai County, Maui County, Education and Research. Current SAC officer terms expire in March 2000.)*

Bill Lennan called for a motion to request that the Sanctuary Manager postpone the officer elections until the new SAC members are in place. Motion failed. Elections to be held immediately. In response to this decision, Mr. Kaufman moved that regardless of the election outcome, Mr. Coon would oversee the day's meeting to its conclusion. Motion carried.

Mr. Coon called for SAC officer nominations. The following members were nominated for the Chair position: Hannah Bernard, Charles Maxwell, Craig MacDonald. Mr. Poirier declined nomination. Hannah Bernard was elected as the new SAC Chair.

Nominations for Vice Chair were as follows: Craig MacDonald, Greg Kaufman, and Charles Maxwell. Patty Miller and Lou Herman declined nomination. Craig MacDonald was elected new SAC Vice Chair.

Nominations for Secretary were as follows: Sallie Beavers, Greg Kaufman, and Mike Stanton. June Harrigan Lum declined nomination. Greg Kaufman was elected new SAC Secretary.

Marine Debris Conference:

Mr. Tom announced that Senator Daniel Inouye provided the Hawaii Sanctuary with \$500,000 to organize an international marine debris conference. Mr. Tom distributed a draft of the conference agenda and noted that the event is scheduled for August 6-11, 2000 at the Hawaii Convention Center in Honolulu. SAC involvement is welcomed.

Some members expressed disappointment with the funding and viewed it as the Sanctuary "taking over" this money. Mr. Tom indicated that this money was appropriated to the

program and the Hawaii Sanctuary was directed to handle the conference planning, not the other way around. Other concerns regarding funding focused on the fact that this money essentially comes out of the Sanctuary's budget. One member expressed outrage that the program's \$1.4M requested budget was divided up between the \$500K conference money and the \$300K spent on SSE. Essentially, after these additional expenses, the Hawaii Sanctuary ended up with the same budget it had last year.

Proposed Resolution Regarding Acting Sanctuary Manager Appointment:

Mr. Tom briefly discussed the background of his proposed detail to Washington DC. He informed the SAC that he will be going to Senator Inouye's office to work on marine-related and Hawaii Sanctuary issues. He will be leaving in September 2000 for one year but will continue to be in touch with activities taking place here. In his absence, Naomi McIntosh, the Oahu Sanctuary Liaison and Operations Manager, will serve as Acting Sanctuary Manager. SAC members questioned who will pay for the detail and Mr. Tom responded that NOAA will pay for it, but essentially the money would come out of the Hawaii Sanctuary budget. In response to other questions, Mr. Tom noted that would be leaving on a detail regardless if it was to work in the Senator's office or in the Washington DC headquarters office.

Mr. Poirier opened up the discussion for the proposed resolution which called for the SAC to recommend that Sanctuary Manager Allen Tom postpone his sabbatical to Washington DC. In the event that Mr. Tom chooses not to postpone, the SAC would recommend that NOAA appoint an Acting Sanctuary Manager, apart from the existing staff, during the interim. Copies of the resolution would be forwarded to the Secretary of Commerce, the Governor of the State of Hawaii, the NOAA Under Secretary for Oceans and Atmosphere, and members of Hawaii's congressional delegation.

Discussion ensued regarding the necessity of this resolution. The SAC questioned Mr. Poirier's purpose for proposing the resolution and he indicated that Mr. Tom's detail would be detrimental to the Sanctuary program and questioned Ms. McIntosh's ability to take on the responsibilities as acting manager in addition to her current duties. One member supported the resolution on the grounds that NOAA should bring in an acting manager that is sufficiently qualified for the position. Furthermore, it was suggested that the acting manager should be located on Maui since the majority of Sanctuary waters are in Maui. It was stressed that the Sanctuary needs to look for the best replacement possible as the program will be looking at state reauthorization within the next two years.

Other members spoke in support of Ms. McIntosh being appointed to the task, citing the need for continuity in the position and an understanding of the existing program. It was suggested that Ms. McIntosh, as well as Dr. Walters, consider spending some time in Maui to maintain a Sanctuary presence there. Others noted, however, that in this age of instant communication it might not be critical, particularly since Mr. Tom spends a large part of his time away from Maui on travel. Several members spoke in support of Ms. McIntosh being appointed as acting manager and noted that this option would be the most expedient as it would take NOAA several months to even decide who would be sent out here in Mr. Tom's absence. On a final note, Dr. Walters expressed concern on behalf of the state that the acting manager, whoever it may be, have a full understanding of what the state partnership means.

Mr. Coon called for a vote on the motion to approve the proposed resolution. Motion failed.

State Boat Discussion:

Jeff Walters indicated that the Sanctuary needs at least one vessel to conduct various education and research projects. He further noted that a boat would serve as an outreach and promotional tool as well as provide an on-the-water presence for the Sanctuary. He stated that each time the Sanctuary charters a vessel for a project, the cost is \$800 to \$900 a day. Over time, this adds up to a substantial cost. Dr. Walters indicated that such a vessel would be Sanctuary boat and would be housed with DLNR's Division of Aquatic Resources (DAR) on Maui. DAR would help pay for maintenance and would occasionally use the boat when it is not being used by the Sanctuary. Furthermore, DAR has given a verbal commitment to provide a staff person to operate and maintain the boat on a part-time basis. Dr. Walters noted that the boat would be approximately 26 to 30 feet with a cabin. The cost would be approximately \$65K to \$80K. He further indicated that the state currently has \$30K earmarked for this acquisition.

Some members responded that the time has not come for this idea. One member noted that priorities for this sanctuary are research and education. One of the controversial issues surrounding the sanctuary during its approval process was a fear that it would turn into another layer of bureaucracy. A boat, such as the one proposed, would make it easier to turn Sanctuary priorities to enforcement.

Dr. Walters called for a motion requesting the SAC to support the acquisition of a boat to be paid for by the Sanctuary. Mr. Kaufman called for another motion that the SAC table the discussion and refer the issue to a committee. Motion carried. Mr. Coon stated that the issue would be referred to the research and education committees to review. They will offer a recommendation at the next SAC meeting. It was further requested that the state prepare a more detailed proposal on this with cost fact sheets. This information should be provided to the committees within the next three weeks.

Working Group Meeting Times:

Mr. Coon suggested that the SAC hold twice as many working group meetings as SAC meetings. These working groups would meet regularly once a month and would include a larger percentage of the community at these meetings. In response to this suggestion, Mr. Kaufman called for a motion that the SAC meet on a quarterly basis to free up money for the working groups to meet more often. Motion carried. Working group chairs were requested to develop a plan on what they would like to accomplish and present this to the SAC at the next meeting. Patty Miller volunteered to check with the Department of Education about using their videoconferencing system. Holding daylong meetings to allow each of the working groups to use the system is one possibility.

CO2 Ocean Sequestration Experiment Presentation:

Dr. Gerard Nihous, Senior Ocean Engineer for the Pacific International Center for High Technology Research (PICHTER) was introduced. Dr. Nihous indicated that PICHTER Project Manager, Dr. Stephen Masutani, was not able to attend this meeting.

Dr. Nihous provided an overview of the project and acknowledged that the experiment will take place close to Sanctuary boundaries. The Hawaii experiment will be conducted for two weeks during the summer of 2001 and will involve injecting CO2 into waters around Keahole Point on the Big Island. The primary purpose of this experiment is to study greenhouse warming.

According to Dr. Nihous, the effectiveness of this project will be judged by reduced transient atmospheric peaks and delays in occurrence of CO₂ peaks. Initial modeling efforts suggest that large amounts of CO₂ should be sequestered and greater depths are more effective. The project will be done in 5 phases. Phase 1 will include testing in Hawaii waters in the summer.

Experiment objectives: To verify computer and laboratory predictions of the behavior of CO₂ in deep seawater for the smallest times and space scales as well as document any environmental change. Tests are designed for minimal impact while allowing for the collection of measurable data. Both require the use of supercomputers.

Advantages of using the Keahole Point site:

1. NELHA's reputation for ocean research
2. Easy access to targeted depths (800-1000 meters)
3. Long-time involvement of researchers from PICHTR and UH (HNEI)
4. Understanding among participating countries that the three phases of the CTI project should take place in different locations.

Proposed Tests:

1. Overall duration approximately 2 weeks, less than 40 hours of testing.
2. Overall cumulative amount of commercial grade CO₂ to be injected (40 to 60 tonnes).
3. Flow rate range: 0.1 to 1.0 kg/s.
4. Proposed measurements: visual (for liquid CO₂ droplets), pH, dic, bacterial biomass and growth rate in seafloor sediments.

Infrastructure:

1. Pressurized liquid CO₂ will be delivered to a nozzle on the seafloor via a small diameter tube (1 to 1.5")
2. The baseline design calls for a seafloor mounted steel tube originating from the shoreline
3. Measurements would be accomplished by up to 2 ROVs surveying the carbon-rich plume; done in labs on-board a research vessel
 - a. Knowledge about deep-water fauna is limited though slowly increasing. There is a low density of individuals, high density of species, thermocline and oxygen minimum depth represent barriers for many species, deep water physico-chemical parameters are much less variable than in shallow waters.
 - b. CO₂ is a known anesthetic for fish. Marine animals are generally intolerant to pH changes, but metabolism plays a large role. Sessile animals, especially with external calcareous skeletons would be at higher risk.
 - c. Survey cruises would better characterize the deep-sea environment at the project site. An environmental report will be written in 2000. A study of bacterial populations in seafloor sediments is planned. Efforts are underway to expand biological work. Studies of "analog" environments (e.g. Loihi) may be attempted.
4. Conclusions: The project is a small step to scientifically evaluate the concept of CO₂ ocean sequestration. It does not imply advocacy for CO₂ ocean sequestration. It is designed to minimize inadvertent harm to the environment, in space and time. The permitting process is thorough and great efforts have been taken to inform the public.

Upon completion of the presentation, Dr. Rob Wilder of the Pacific Whale Foundation spoke out against the project and asked what PICHTR's definition of "incremental" is. Dr. Wilder questioned where this experiment will end and noted that the project is not really "sequestration", but rather dumping. He further noted that the research team is from the physical sciences rather than the biological sciences. Dr. Wilder stressed that in order to solve global warming, we need to focus on prevention. Dumping cannot solve global

warming - this should be the last resort. He suggested looking at using fuel cell power, which does not use CO₂. If we continue to allow dumping (of CO₂) there is no incentive to stop harmful behavior.

Other questions from the SAC regarding the presentation included whether the pipes will be run through the Sanctuary (no, pipes will most likely be run from a ship anchored offshore), if there is a possibility that CO₂ would come to the surface (no, this will not affect fisheries or recreational users as the CO₂ will be transformed), when would project preparation and the actual experiment take place (Preparation would take place approximately two weeks prior if they don't do pipe laying and actual experimentation would take place in July or September; high surf season will be avoided. Delays could make it later.), the time duration that hydrates will stay submerged (The deeper you go, the denser it will be. Hydrates are not very stable and not susceptible to dissolution. Once it dissolves the water will be heavier and will sink.), the volume of release, and whether the experimenters will be conducting a biological baseline (yes).

Upon the conclusion of SAC questions, Mr. Coon requested that the Conservation Committee take the lead on watching this project and providing more information to the SAC.

Sanctuary Manager Report:

Mr. Tom announced that the Sanctuaries Division in Washington, DC has a new Chief, Dan Basta, who will serve in the temporary assignment. Mr. Tom also noted that the Sanctuary program is being elevated within NOAA, meaning that this will bring more visibility to the program and give the SAC more weight. He indicated that Mr. Basta is very results-oriented and would like to see products, especially research, done. The permanent chief position, which is an executive service slot, will be opened up within the next year or so

Mr. Tom acknowledged that the Hawaii Sanctuary will be seeing a \$1.4M budget next year. He also passed around a National Marine Sanctuaries publication and asked the SAC to review it and provide comments back to him. Other handouts were distributed and discussed including the Hawaii Sanctuary's calendar of events and a marine mammal handout. Mr. Tom further reminded the group that the research alternate position has never been filled. He requested the SAC's approval to go out and get applications for this seat. This alternate seat will be initiated along with other seats to be filled this summer.

State Co-manager Report:

Jeff Walters recognized the great contributions that the current SAC officers made to the program and the SAC. He distributed a memo updating the group on the state's latest activities. He introduced Liza Simon, the Sanctuary's new public outreach coordinator, and indicated that she is anxious to get started. Ms. Simon has a strong background in journalism and marketing and will be contacting SAC members over the next few months to discuss projects.

Dr. Walters stated that SSE was a wonderful success and highlighted some of the educational activities that took place over the course of the project. Other projects that the State was involved in includes issuance of state scientific collecting (research) permits, state agency sanctuary management meetings, Kona Ocean User's Workshops, the 13th Biennial Conference on the Biology of Marine Mammals, and the Sanctuary Ocean Count on Oahu.

In response to the discussion of acquiring a sanctuary boat held earlier in the meeting, Dr. Walters acknowledged that he would no longer propose use of the Sanctuary boat for enforcement purposes. He also announced that he will no longer be a voting member of the SAC as it is not fair that he serve in a managerial role as well as a voting advisor to the Sanctuary program. He indicated that DLNR may fill the seat with another DLNR representative.

Hawaii County Report:

Sallie Beavers announced that she has been invited to speak at each of the state's West Hawaii Fisheries Council meetings. At the last meeting, she gave an introduction and discussed what the Sanctuary has been involved in to date. Ms. Beavers indicated that SSE activities were very successful and many schools were involved. Additionally, the Family Ocean Fair at Kona's King Kamehameha's Kona Beach Hotel was a success, and the community would like to see more events held there. She noted that Sanctuary Ocean Count was also successful. She has been looking for a good location for a viewscope and signage in Kona; would like to form a partnership with the hotels that currently have scopes but no interpretive signage; and would like to approach dive shops and organizations to elevate awareness of the Sanctuary. Ms. Beavers also called for a motion to have the SAC write a letter to Dan Basta in support of establishing an office in Kona. Motion passed.

Kauai County Report:

Walter Haas expressed excitement in Patty Miller's teleconference with the various schools in Hawaii, including Kaua'i and American Samoa. Dr. Haas announced that the Kaua'i Family Ocean Fair will be held on Saturday, March 25 at the Kilauea Point National Wildlife Refuge. He indicated that the Kilauea Point Natural History association donated \$3500 for the fair and a number of organizations will be participating for the first time this year. Dr. Haas will serve as the MC for the lectures. He also stated that a Sanctuary Ocean Count will be conducted in conjunction to the fair for the first time this year. On a final note, Jean Souza has been looking at office space on Kaua'i.

Maui County Report:

Hannah Bernard attended a number of the SSE events and has participated in monthly meetings with the Coral Reef Network. They have been pushing forward to get Act 306 approved.

City and County of Honolulu Report:

Bill Friedl indicated that the O'ahu Sanctuary Ocean Count was successful and he attended the Humpback Whale Awareness Day at Sea Life Park on the following day.

Research Working Group Report:

Paul Nachtigall announced that the new Vice Chair for the Research committee is Craig MacDonald. Dr. Nachtigall stated that the marine mammal conference held on Maui was successful. He saw a great deal of participation from the SAC and the Sanctuary contributed a great deal to the meeting. He further indicated that the Research meeting held earlier (from 8:30 - 10:00 a.m.) focused on the goals and mission statement of the working group. He discussed the procurement of research proposals and mentioned that Dr. Walters is working on writing a research plan.

Conservation Committee Report:

Lou Herman distributed correspondence regarding the committee's recommendations on the LFA/Surtass project, the Hawaiian Shallow Water Training Range project, and the ATOC project. Included in his handouts was a copy of a letter of receipt from Senator Akaka regarding the committee's ATOC comments.

Education Committee report:

Patty Miller will work with Liza Simon on developing a strategic education plan. She also discussed the various SSE education activities and showed a video done by some of the Kaua'i students involved in SSE. Ms. Miller acknowledged that Jim Coon and Greg Kaufman provided boats for these activities, Walter Haas funded some of the Kaua'i students to fly to Maui for events, Mike Stanton assisted with some of the events as well, and Hannah Bernard provided naturalist commentary on one of the boats.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:05 p.m. The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 3, 2000 at the Honolulu International Airport.